Thomas Poon, Ph.D. Executive Vice President and Provost

Dorothea Herreiner, Ph.D. Faculty Senate President

COMMENTS ON THE RANK AND TENURE PROCESS

Dear Provost Poon and Professor Herreiner,

Having completed the review of applications for tenure and promotion for the 2021-22 academic year, the Committee on Rank and Tenure (CRT) would like to take the opportunity to comment on a few issues that arose during our review.

Timely Notice of Issues to Candidates:

This was a very strong year for candidates, with only a small number of cases where the department summaries indicated any significant concerns with the candidates' applications. However, in those cases, the CRT noticed a pattern of the department failing to alert the candidate to those concerns earlier in the tenure process. Ideally, the candidate's chair(s) should alert the candidate to any perceived shortcomings in their research (none of the contested cases focused on teaching or service) in their responses to the candidate's FSRs. Certainly, any issues should be brought up in the fourth-year review. Particularly in cases where concerns arise in part from methodological and theoretical disagreements between subfields, departments have a duty to inform the candidates of those concerns when he or she has ample opportunity to address them.

Dean's Letters:

The Dean's letters are an important part of the record. The CRT noted factual errors in two letters written by the Dean of CFA/Interim Dean of SFTV. In one case, the department vote was inaccurately represented. In another case, he appeared to be confusing two different candidates.

Also, there were a small number of cases where various Deans did not give a clear recommendation, but rather described their support as "tentative" or with "reservations".

We believe that because tenure and promotion is a binary decision, Deans should be encouraged to give clear statements of their recommendations.

Peer Review Policy:

The CRT noted a great deal of variation in whether departments required peer review of teaching, how much peer review was required and how peer review is defined. The Faculty Handbook standards are also vague regarding peer review.

Department Discussion:

The CRT noted that when the external evaluators raised concerns, the department letters did not always address those concerns. It would be helpful if chairs reminded their department of the need to specifically address significant concerns raised by external evaluators.

Department Standards in Candidate Files:

In one case, it appeared that the department standards in the candidate's file was not the final version of the standards that was ultimately approved by the department. While it did not make any difference in that particular case, the CRT suggests that a process be put in place to ensure that all department standards used in the application are the final approved version.

Sincerely,

Evan Al

Evan Gerstmann, Ph.D. (Chair) Department of Political Science Bellarmine College of Liberal Arts

Terese Aceves (Mar 16, 2022 07:12 PDT)

Terese Aceves, Ph.D.

Department of Specialized Programs in Professional Psychology School of Education

Diane Benedict

Diane Benedict, M.F.A.
Department of Theatre Arts and Dance
College of Communication and Fine Arts

Paul A. Harris

Paul Harris, Ph.D.
Department of English
Bellarmine College of Liberal Arts



Thomas Klein, M.F.A.
Department of Animation
School of Film and Television

Blake Mellor, Ph.D.

Department of Mathematics

Seaver College of Science and Engineering

Andrew Rohm, Ph.D.

A Rohm

Department of Marketing

College of Business Administration

Provost letter

Final Audit Report 2022-03-16

Created: 2022-03-15

By: Jasmine Robinson (Jasmine.Robinson@Imu.edu)

Status: Signed

Transaction ID: CBJCHBCAABAATGU-M2DWIRD3b8LQCXi1bapfLZRVkle5

"Provost letter" History

- Document created by Jasmine Robinson (Jasmine.Robinson@Imu.edu) 2022-03-15 9:01:53 PM GMT- IP address: 157.242.192.62
- Document emailed to Evan Gerstmann (evan.gerstmann@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-15 9:03:36 PM GMT
- Email viewed by Evan Gerstmann (evan.gerstmann@lmu.edu) 2022-03-16 0:35:15 AM GMT- IP address: 99.165.126.63
- Document e-signed by Evan Gerstmann (evan.gerstmann@lmu.edu)
 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 0:35:26 AM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 99.165.126.63
- Document emailed to Terese Aceves (terese.aceves@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 0:35:28 AM GMT
- Email viewed by Terese Aceves (terese.aceves@lmu.edu) 2022-03-16 2:12:48 PM GMT- IP address: 23.243.1.108
- Document e-signed by Terese Aceves (terese.aceves@lmu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 2:12:56 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 23.243.1.108
- Document emailed to Diane Benedict (Diane.Benedict@Imu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 2:12:58 PM GMT
- Email viewed by Diane Benedict (Diane.Benedict@Imu.edu) 2022-03-16 3:58:08 PM GMT- IP address: 47.34.199.20
- Document e-signed by Diane Benedict (Diane.Benedict@Imu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 3:58:22 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 47.34.199.20
- Document emailed to Paul Harris (paul.harris@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 3:58:23 PM GMT



- Email viewed by Paul Harris (paul.harris@lmu.edu) 2022-03-16 5:58:20 PM GMT- IP address: 96.41.21.218
- Document e-signed by Paul Harris (paul.harris@lmu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 5:58:41 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 96.41.21.218
- Document emailed to Tom Klein (thomas.klein@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 5:58:43 PM GMT
- Email viewed by Tom Klein (thomas.klein@lmu.edu) 2022-03-16 7:23:56 PM GMT- IP address: 108.184.5.129
- Document e-signed by Tom Klein (thomas.klein@lmu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 7:24:09 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 108.184.5.129
- Document emailed to Blake Mellor (blake.mellor@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 7:24:12 PM GMT
- Document e-signed by Blake Mellor (blake.mellor@lmu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 7:49:15 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 157.242.192.91
- Document emailed to Andrew Rohm (andrew.rohm@lmu.edu) for signature 2022-03-16 7:49:17 PM GMT
- Email viewed by Andrew Rohm (andrew.rohm@lmu.edu) 2022-03-16 7:52:16 PM GMT- IP address: 157.242.192.92
- Document e-signed by Andrew Rohm (andrew.rohm@lmu.edu)

 Signature Date: 2022-03-16 7:54:05 PM GMT Time Source: server- IP address: 157.242.192.92
- Agreement completed.
 2022-03-16 7:54:05 PM GMT

